



PALGRAVE  
STUDIES  
IN SCIENCE,  
KNOWLEDGE  
AND POLICY

**PUBLICS AND  
THEIR HEALTH  
SYSTEMS**

*Rethinking Participation*

Ellen Stewart



## Publics and Their Health Systems

*Palgrave Studies in Science, Knowledge and Policy*

Series Editors: **Katherine Smith**, University of Edinburgh, UK, and  
**Richard Freeman**, University of Edinburgh, UK

*Titles include:*

Sudeepa Abeysinghe

PANDEMICS, SCIENCE AND POLICY

H1N1 and the World Health Organization

Katherine Smith

BEYOND EVIDENCE-BASED POLICY IN PUBLIC HEALTH

The Interplay of Ideas

Ellen Stewart

PUBLICS AND THEIR HEALTH SYSTEMS

Rethinking Participation

---

**Palgrave Studies in Science, Knowledge and Policy**

**Series Standing Order ISBN 978-1-137-39461-3 (Hardback)**

*(outside North America only)*

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBNs quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills,  
Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

---

# Publics and Their Health Systems

## Rethinking Participation

Ellen Stewart

*University of Edinburgh, UK*

palgrave  
macmillan



© Ellen Stewart 2016

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2016 978-1-137-46716-4

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted her right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2016 by  
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-57020-1      ISBN 978-1-137-46717-1 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1007/978-1-137-46717-1

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Stewart, Ellen, 1984–, author.

Publics and their health systems : rethinking participation / Ellen Stewart.

p.; cm. — (Palgrave studies in science, knowledge and policy)

Much of chapter 7, and several paragraphs of chapter 8, were previously published by Taylor and Francis in *Critical policy studies* (Vol. 9, no. 1, 2015). Much of chapter 2 was previously published by Policy Press in *Policy & politics* (Vol. 41, No. 2, 2013).

Includes bibliographical references.

Summary: "Drawing on a detailed case study of Scotland's National Health Service, this book argues that debates about citizen participation in health systems are disproportionately dominated by techniques of invited participation. A 'system's-eye' perspective, while often well-intentioned, has blinded us to other standpoints for understanding the complex relationship between publics and their health systems. *Publics and Their Health Systems* takes a 'citizen's-eye' perspective, exploring not only conventional invited participation, but also the realms of representative democracy, contentious protest politics, and the micro-level tactics used by individual citizens in their encounters with health services. The book highlights more oppositional dynamics than those which characterise much invited participation, and argues that understanding these is a crucial step towards a more inclusive and democratic health system"—Provided by publisher.!

I. Title. II. Series: Palgrave studies in science, knowledge, and policy.

[DNLN: 1. Consumer Participation—Scotland. 2. Health Policy—Scotland. 3. Health Planning—Scotland. WA 540 FS2]

RA987.S4

362.109411—dc23

2015025960

Typeset by MPS Limited, Chennai, India.

*For Magnus and Greta*



# Contents

<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>List of Acronyms</i>	x
1 Introducing Citizen Participation in Health Systems	1
2 Scotland's NHS: Citizen Participation and Mutuality in Scottish Health Policy	19
3 Administering the System: Citizen Participation as Committee Work	36
4 Extending the System: Citizen Participation as Outreach Work	55
5 Electing the System: Citizen Participation as Representative Democracy	68
6 Fighting the System: Citizen Participation as Protest	89
7 Playing the System: Citizen Participation as Subversive Service Use	101
8 Rethinking Citizen Participation in Health Systems	121
<i>References</i>	134
<i>Index</i>	149



# List of Figures and Tables

## Figures

6.1	Three categories of tactics in hospital closure protests	93
8.1	Modes of participation in health	123

## Tables

1.1	Studies of public perspectives on participation in health in general	6
1.2	Typologies of 'level' of participation	10
2.1	Individual and collective involvement proposals within Scottish health White Papers 2000–2007	27
7.1	Characteristics of young adult interviewees	103
8.1	Matrix of modes of participation	127

# Acknowledgements

My thanks go, first and foremost, to everyone who has taken part in my research through interviews or allowing me to observe them in meetings. Anonymity requires that individuals are not credited with their statements in the text, but my participants' thought-provoking reflections on Scotland's health services and their relationship with them are the backbone of this book.

My interest in citizen participation was sparked by the creativity and determination I saw around me while working and volunteering for a range of charities in England and Scotland. Special mention should go to Pilton Community Health Project, where I volunteered during my PhD. My research was enriched by the wisdom and encouragement of many individuals with whom I've been lucky enough to study and work at LSE, St Andrews, and Edinburgh. Particular mention must go to Richard Freeman, Kathryn Backett-Milburn, Katherine Smith, John Clarke, Janet Newman, Sarah Cunningham-Burley, Peter Donnelly, Scott Greer, Corra Boushel, and Catherine-Rose Stocks-Rankin.

Much of Chapter 7, and several paragraphs of Chapter 8, were previously published as Stewart, E. (2015), Seeking outsider perspectives in interpretive research: young adults and citizen participation in health policy. *Critical Policy Studies* 9(2). Much of Chapter 2 was previously published as Stewart, E. (2013) A mutual NHS? The development of distinctive public involvement policy in devolved Scotland. *Policy & Politics* 41(2). My thanks to Taylor & Francis, and to Policy Press, respectively, for permission to reproduce the text here.

Chapter 6 is based on previously unpublished data from the statutory independent evaluation of the Scottish Health Board Elections and Alternative Pilots. My thanks go to the Scottish Government for permission to use the data for academic purposes, and of course to my colleagues Peter Donnelly, Scott Greer, and Iain Wilson for their agreement to use the data.

My research has been supported financially by an Economic and Social Research Council PhD studentship and a Chief Scientist Office Postdoctoral Training Fellowship. Research reported in Chapter 7 was conducted with financial and practical support from the Scottish Primary Care Research Network.

Finally, my thanks to my parents, sisters, and partner Jonny who have supported me during the writing of this book.