



PLATO

AND THE POST-SOCRATIC DIALOGUE

THE RETURN TO THE
PHILOSOPHY OF NATURE

*

CHARLES H. KAHN

CAMBRIDGE

PLATO AND THE POST-SOCRATIC DIALOGUE

Plato's late dialogues have often been neglected because they lack the literary charm of his earlier masterpieces. Charles H. Kahn proposes a unified view of these diverse and difficult works, from the *Parmenides* and *Theaetetus* to the *Sophist* and *Timaeus*, showing how they gradually develop the framework for Plato's late metaphysics and cosmology. The *Parmenides*, with its attack on the theory of Forms and its baffling series of antinomies, has generally been treated apart from the rest of Plato's late work. Kahn shows that this perplexing dialogue is the curtain-raiser on Plato's last metaphysical enterprise: the step-by-step construction of a wider theory of Being that provides the background for the creation story of the *Timaeus*. This rich study, the natural successor to Kahn's earlier *Plato and the Socratic Dialogue*, will interest a wide range of readers in ancient philosophy and science.

CHARLES H. KAHN is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy in the University of Pennsylvania. His publications include *Anaximander and the Origins of Greek Cosmology* (3rd edn., 1994); *The Art and Thought of Heraclitus: A New Arrangement and Translation of the Fragments with Literary and Philosophical Commentary* (1979); *Plato and the Socratic Dialogue: The Philosophical Use of a Literary Form* (1997); *Pythagoras and the Pythagoreans: A Brief History* (2001).

PLATO AND THE POST-SOCRATIC DIALOGUE

The Return to the Philosophy of Nature

CHARLES H. KAHN



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107031456

© Charles H. Kahn 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Kahn, Charles H.

Plato and the post-Socratic dialogue : the return to the philosophy of nature / Charles H. Kahn.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-03145-6 (hardback)

1. Plato. I. Title.

B395.K235 2013

184-dc23

2013014286

ISBN 978-1-107-03145-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Edna always

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<i>Note on Chronology</i>	xvi
1 The <i>Parmenides</i> I	
1.1 Part One: the six <i>aporias</i>	3
1.2 Part Two: the eight deductions	18
2 The <i>Theaetetus</i> in the context of the later Dialogues 47	
2.1 The hermeneutical problem: how to read the <i>Theaetetus</i>	47
2.2 Part One: knowledge as sense perception	52
2.3 The ontology of flux	53
2.4 The <i>koina</i> as the object of thought (<i>dianoia</i>)	60
2.5 The unique role of Being	66
2.6 Part Two: knowledge as true <i>doxa</i> and the problem of false judgment	68
2.7 Three <i>Aporias</i> on false judgment (188a–190e)	69
2.8 The wax tablet	72
2.9 The bird-cage	73
2.10 Rejecting the definition of knowledge as true judgment	76
2.11 Part Three: knowledge as true judgment with a <i>logos</i>	77
2.12 Socrates' dream: antecedents in the <i>Cratylus</i>	78
2.13 Socrates' dream: positive contributions	81
2.14 Fruitless attempts to interpret <i>logos</i>	84
Appendix 1 On the narrow conception of <i>aisthēsis</i> in the central argument	86
Appendix 2 The digression	88
Appendix 3 Sense perception as a system of motions	90
3 Being and Not-Being in the <i>Sophist</i> 94	
3.1 Limits of this Dialogue	94
3.2 Analysis of <i>einai</i>	95

3.3	The topic of Being in the <i>Sophist</i>	98
3.4	The <i>aporias</i> concerning Not-Being (237b–239b)	99
3.5	The <i>aporias</i> concerning Being: cosmologists and monists (242c–245e)	103
3.6	The battle between gods and giants: corporealists and Friends of Forms (246a–249d)	105
3.7	Final <i>aporias</i> about Being: (i) two modes of predication (249e–250e)	107
3.8	(ii) The last <i>aporia</i> : the paradox of the Late-learners (251a–c)	109
3.9	Refutation of the Late-learners: some Forms combine (251d–252c)	110
3.10	Not all Forms combine: Motion and Rest do not (252d)	111
3.11	Network of Forms (252e–254b)	112
3.12	Five great Forms and the definition of Not-Being	114
3.13	Analysis of <i>logos</i> as propositional structure (260a–262e)	123
3.14	Definition of true and false <i>logos</i> (262e–263d)	126
3.15	Conclusion (263d–268d)	129
4	The new dialectic: from the <i>Phaedrus</i> to the <i>Philebus</i>	131
4.1	Introduction	131
4.2	Dialectic before the <i>Phaedrus</i>	132
4.3	Dialectic in the <i>Phaedrus</i>	135
4.4	Dialectic in the <i>Sophist</i> and the <i>Statesman</i>	139
4.5	Dialectic in the <i>Philebus</i>	148
5	The <i>Philebus</i> and the movement to cosmology	157
5.1	Plato's return to the subject matter of the Presocratics	157
5.2	The world as a work of art	159
5.3	Introduction of the world soul	161
5.4	Cosmology in the <i>Philebus</i> : the Announcement	163
5.5	Limit and Unlimited in the structure of the cosmos	165
5.6	Comparison with the <i>Timaeus</i>	169
5.7	Relation between cosmology and dialectic	170
5.8	A sketch of cosmology as object of dialectic	173
6	The <i>Timaeus</i> and the completion of the project: the recovery of the natural world	176
6.1	The myth of creation	176
6.2	The Forms as the model for creation	180
6.3	The extension of Forms in the model	181
6.4	Status of Becoming and the problem of flux	185
6.5	The Receptacle and the new introduction to creation (48e–53b)	189

6.6	Images and imitation: the <i>Timaeus</i> solution to the problem of participation	200
6.7	Textual support for this interpretation	203
6.8	Final thoughts on the relation of mathematics to the Forms	204
6.9	Supplementary note on sense qualities in the <i>Timaeus</i>	206
Epilogue.	Plato as a political philosopher	214
1	Cosmology in <i>Laws</i> X	214
2	The myth of the <i>Statesman</i>	220
3	On the first best constitution in the <i>Laws</i>	235
	<i>Bibliography</i>	238
	<i>Index</i>	242