



PHILOSOPHICAL FOUNDATIONS OF

Property Law

James Penner
& Henry E. Smith

OXFORD

PHILOSOPHICAL FOUNDATIONS
OF PROPERTY LAW

Philosophical Foundations of Property Law

Edited by
JAMES PENNER
and
HENRY E. SMITH

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© The several contributors 2013

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First Edition published in 2013

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted
by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence
Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI
and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2013942281

ISBN 978-0-19-967358-2

Printed in Great Britain by
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	vii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xiii
<i>Introduction</i>	xv
1. 'To Bestow Stability upon Possession': Hume's Alternative to Locke <i>Jeremy Waldron</i>	1
2. Productive Use in Acquisition, Accession, and Labour Theory <i>Eric R. Claeys</i>	13
3. Property and Necessity <i>Dennis Klimchuk</i>	47
4. Private Property and Public Welfare <i>Alan Brudner</i>	68
5. Average Reciprocity of Advantage <i>Brian Angelo Lee</i>	99
6. Some Strings Attached: The Morality of Proprietary Estoppel <i>Irit Samet</i>	128
7. Possession and Use <i>Arthur Ripstein</i>	156
8. Possession and the Distractions of Philosophy <i>Lisa M. Austin</i>	182
9. The Relativity of Title and <i>Causa Possessionis</i> <i>Larissa Katz</i>	202
10. Defining Property Rights <i>Simon Douglas and Ben McFarlane</i>	219
11. On the Very Idea of Transmissible Rights <i>James Penner</i>	244
12. Psychologies of Property (and Why Property is not a Hawk/Dove Game) <i>Carol M. Rose</i>	272

13. Property and Disagreement	289
<i>Stephen R. Munzer</i>	
14. Emergent Property	320
<i>Henry E. Smith</i>	
<i>References</i>	339
<i>Index</i>	357

Table of Cases

Advanced Industrial Technology Corp. Ltd v Bond Street Jewellers Ltd (2006) EWCA Civ 923	207
Allen v Flood (1898) AC 1	226–7, 230
Anchor Brewhouse Developments Ltd v Berkeley House (Docklands Developments) Ltd (1987) 38 BLR 82, 284 EG 625.	225
Anderson v Gouldberg 51 Minn 294, 53 NW 636 (1892)	217
Anglian Water Services v Crawshaw Robbins & Co. Ltd (2001) BLR 173	231
Armory v Delamirie (1722) 1 Stra 505; 93 ER 644 (KB)	206, 213
Armstrong v United States 364 US 40 (1960)	124
Ashburn Anstalt v Arnold (1989) Ch 1.	241
Asher v Whitlock (1865) LR 1 QB 1.	213
Aston Cantlow and Wilmcote with Billesley Parochial Church Council v Wallbank (2004) 1 AC 546.	298
Attorney General of Hong Kong v Humphreys Estate (Queen’s Gardens) Ltd (1987) AC 114 (PC).	143
Austerberry v Oldham Corporation (1855) 29 Ch D 750 (CA).	197
Automobile Ins. Co. of Hartford, Conn. v Kirby 144 So 123 (Ala Ct App 1932)	207
Bank of Credit and Commerce International (Overseas) Ltd v Akindele [2001] Ch 437 (CA).	241
Bank of New Zealand v Greenwood (1984) 1 NZLR 525	232
Barbados Trust Co. Ltd v Bank of Zambia (2007) EWCA Civ 148	241
Barker v Stickney (1919) 1 KB 121.	241
Bartlett v Budd 2 F Cas 966 (D C Mass 1868)	37
Beale v Harvey (2003) EWCA Civ 1883	151
Beverley’s Case (1603) 4 Co Rep 123b, 76 ER 1118 (KB).	204
Birmingham Development Company Ltd v Tyler (2008) EWCA Civ 859.	230–1
Bixler v First National Bank of Oregon 619 P2d 895 (Or Ct App 1980).	137
BMW Financial Services (GB) Ltd v Bhagwanani (2007) All ER (D) 26 (CA).	224
Bradford v Pickles (1895) AC 587.	227
Brady v Steamship African Queen 179 F Supp 321 (E D Va 1960).	39
Brewer Street Investments Ltd v Barclays (1954) 1 QB 428 (CA).	146
Bridges v Hawkesworth (1851) 21 LJQB 75 (QB)	209
Brown v Gobble 196 W Va 559, 474 S.E.2d 489 (1996).	204
Bryant v Lefever (1879) 4 CPD 172	231
Buckinghamshire County Council v Moran (1989) 3 WLR 152, 2 ALL ER 225 (CA)	80
Buckley v Gross (1863) 122 ER 213.	210, 218
Burrows v Sharp (1991) 23 HLR 82.	151
Cambridge Water Co. Ltd v Eastern Counties Leather Plc (1994) 2 AC 264, (1994) 1 All ER 53.	225
Campbell v Griffin (2001) EWCA Civ 990, All ER (D) 294.	151
Campbell v Race 61 Mass 408, 54 Am Dec 728 (1851)	63
Canada Colors & Chemicals Ltd v Shea Brothers (1945) OWN 828 (Ont HCJ)	218
Canada Trust Co. v Ontario Human Rights Commission (1990) 69 DLR 4d 321.	200
Chicago, B & Q. R. Co. v Chicago 166 US 226 (1897)	100
Claridge v South Staffordshire Tramway Co. (1892) 1 QB 422	206
Clark v Maloney 3 Harr 68; 1840 WL 353 (Del 1840).	209
Clarke v Adie (1876) 2 App Cas 423 (HL)	212

Club Cruise Entertainment & Travelling Services Europe BV v Department for Transport (2008) EWHC 2794 (Comm)	222, 229
Cobbe v Yeoman's Row Management Ltd (2008) 1 WLR 1752 (HL)	128, 136, 142–5, 148, 153–4
Cochrane v Rymill (1879) 40 LT 744.	210
Cole v North Western Bank (1875) LR 10 CP 354	207
Commonwealth v Plymouth Coal Co. 232 Pa 141, 81 A. 148 (1911)	108
Commonwealth of Australia v Verwayen (1990) 170 CLR 394 (HC Aus).	149
Coniston Corporation v Village of Hoffman Estates 844 F2d 461 (7th Cir 1988).	105
Consolidated Co. v Curtis (1892) 1 QB 495.	210
Cook v Thomas and another (2010) EWCA Civ 227.	147
Copeland v Greenhalf (1952) Ch 488.	237
Costello v Chief Constable of Derbyshire (2001) 1 WLR 1437 (CA)	79
Crabb v Arun District Council (1975) EWCA Civ 7.	153–4
Crossco No. 4 Unlimited and others v Jolan Ltd and others (2011) EWCA Civ 1619 (CA)	144
Cumming v Cumming 3 Kelly 460; 1847 WL 1361 (Ga 1847).	209
D Pride & Partners v Institute for Animal Health (2009) EWHC 1617 (QB)	222, 229, 231
Davis v Whitridge 33 SCL 232, 1848 WL 2429 (SC Ct App L 1848)	212
Deaderick v Oulds 86 Tenn 14; 5 SW 487 (1887).	209
De Beers Abrasive Products Ltd v International General Electric of New York Ltd (1975) 2 ALL ER 599.	229
Decker v Browning-Ferris Industries of Colorado Inc. 931 P2d 436 (Colo 1997)	300
Dillwyn v Llewelyn (1862) EWHC Ch J67, 4 De G F & J 517.	148
DKLR Holding Co. (No. 2) Pty Ltd v Commissioner of Stamp Duties (1982) 149 CLR 431.	241
Doe v Birchmore (1839) 9 Ad & El 662	214
Doe d Bullen v Mills (1834) 2 Ad & El 17.	212
Doe d Carter v Barnard (1849) 13 QB 945.	218
Don King Productions Inc. v Warren (2000) Ch 291	241
Douglas Valley Finance Co. Ltd v S Hughes (Hirers) Ltd (1969) 1 QB 738.	217, 228
Dwyer v Staunton (1947) 4 DLR 393 (Alberta Dist Ct)	63–4, 66
Eads v Brazelton 22 Ark 499 (1861)	39
Earl of Worcester v Finch (1600) 4 Co Inst 85	241
Ellis v Loftus (1874) LR 10 CP 10.	225
England v Cowley (1873) LR 8 Ex 126	217
Euclid v Ambler 272 U.S. 365 (1926)	114–15
Everman v Hyman 29 NE 1140 (Ind App 1892)	207
Farah Constructions Pty Ltd v Say-Dee Pty Ltd (2007) HCA 22	241
Field v Sullivan (1923) VLR 70.	218
Fisher v Brooker (2009) UKHL 41.	129
Fisher v Steward 1 Smith 60 (NH 1804)	14, 40–4
Fontainebleau Hotel Corp. v Forty-Five-Twenty-Five Inc. 114 So 2d 357 (Fla Dist Ct App 1959)	178
Fouldes v Willoughby (1841) 8 M & W 540, 151 ER 1153 (Exch)	207, 210
Fowler v Hollins (1872) LR 7 QB 616.	238
Freeman v Cooke (1848) 154 ER 652 (Exch)	215
French v Pearce 8 Conn 439 (1831)	35
Gale v Lindo (1687) 1 Vern 475.	215
Ghen v Rich 8 F 159 (D C Mass 1881)	37, 39
Giumelli v Giumelli (1999) 196 CLR 101 (HC Aus).	149
Goddard v Winchell 52 NW 1124 (Iowa 1892)	32
Goldman v Hargrave (1967) 1 AC 645.	225
Gonthier v Orange Contract Scaffolding Ltd (2003) EWCA Civ 873.	146

Greasley v Cooke (1980) 1 WLR 1306	143
Gregory v Piper (1829) 9 B & C 951	225
Hairston v Danville and Western Ry. Co. 208 US 598 (1908)	72
Hall v Hebert (1993) 2 SCR 159	199
Hannah v Peel (1945) KB 509	206
Haq v Island Homes Housing Association and another (2011) EWCA Civ 805 (CA)	143, 145
Haslem v Lockwood 37 Conn 500 (1871)	13–15, 19, 24, 28, 30–1, 34, 36, 38, 43
Henry and Mitchell v Henry (2010) UKPC 3	147
Hibbert v McKierman (1948) 2 KB 142	210
Hill v Tupper (1863) 2 H & C 121 (Exch Ch)	221, 234–5
Hodel v Irving 481 US 704 (1987)	291
Hoffman v Red Owl Stores Inc. 26 Wis 2d 683, 133 NW 2d 267 (1965)	141
Hollins v Fowler (1872) LR 7 QB 616	210
Horn v Cole 51 N.H. 287, 1868 WL 2290 (1868)	215
Hunter v Canary Wharf (1997) AC 655, 2 All ER 426	231–2
Hurst v Picture Theatres Ltd (1915) 1 KB 1	333
Illinois Steel Co. v Budzisz 106 Wis. 499, 81 N. W. 1027, 82 N. W. 534 (1900)	204
Illinois Steel Co. v Paczocha 139 Wis 23, 119 NW 550 (1909)	204
Jackman v Rosenbaum Co. 260 US 22 (1922)	102, 106
Jacque v Steenberg Homes Inc. 209 Wis 2d 605, 563 NW 2d 154 (1997)	180, 285
Jennings v Rice (2002) EWCA Civ 159	149, 153
Jonathan Yearworth & Ors v North Bristol NHS Trust (2009) EWCA Civ 37	233–4
Jorden v Money (1854) 5 HLC 185	146
Keeble v Hickeringill (1707) 11 East 574, 103 ER 1127 (QB)	32–4, 43, 230
Keewalk Proceedings Ltd v Waller (2002) EWCA Civ 1076 (CA)	145
Kelo v City of New London 545 US 469 (2005)	161
Kepley v Scully 57 NE 187 (Ill. 1900)	204
Keystone Bituminous Coal Ass'n v DeBenedictis 480 US 470 (1987)	104
King v David Allen & Sons Billposting Ltd (1916) 2 AC 54	241
King's Prerogative in Saltpetre (1606) 12 Co Rep 12, 77 ER 1294 (KB)	63–4, 66
Kynoch v Rowlands (1912) 1 Ch 527	225
Lamper's Case (1613) 10 Co Rep 46b	211
Lampston's Executors v Preston's Executors 1 J J Marsh (24 Ky) 454, 1829 WL 1248, 19 Am Dec 104 (Ky 1829)	28, 41
Lavery v Snethen 68 NY 522 (1877)	204
Lawrence v Obee (1815) 1 Stark 22	225
Laws v Florinplace (1981) 1 All ER 659 (Ch)	231
Leigh & Silavan Ltd v Aliakmon Shipping Co. Ltd (1986) AC 785	241
L'Hote v New Orleans 177 US 587 (1900)	106, 116
Lord Compton's Case (1580) 4 Leon 196 (CB)	241
Loretto v Teleprompter Manhattan CATV Corp. 458 US 419 (1982)	73
MacKenzie v Blindman Valley Co-operative Association (1947) 2 DLR 687, 2 WWR 443	210
Malik v Kaylan (2010) EWCA Civ 113	151
Manitoba Fisheries Ltd v The Queen (1979) 1 SCR 101, 88 DLR (3d) 462	68
Mapel v John 42 W Va 30, 24 SE 608 (1896)	108
Marzocca v Ferone 461 A2d 1133 (NJ 1983)	332
MCC Proceeds Inc. v Lehman Bros. (1998) 4 All ER 675	241
Meering v Graham White Aviation Company Ltd (1918–19) All ER Ext 1490	212
Merry v Green (1841) 7 M & W 623	210
Miller v Jackson (1977) EWCA Civ 6, 3 ALL ER 338	180
Mogul Steamship Co. Ltd v McGregor, Gow & Co. (1892) AC 25	229
Moorgate Mercantile v Finch (1962) 1 QB 701, 3 WLR 110	218
Morey v Fitzgerald 56 Vt 487, 48 Am Rep 811 (1884)	63

Mouse's Case (1608) 12 Co Rep 63, 77 ER 1341 (KB)	63–6
National Provincial Bank v Ainsworth (1965) AC 1175 (HL)	241
Nebraska v Iowa 143 US 359 (1892)	40
OBG v Allan (2008) 1 AC 1	237–9
OBG Ltd and others v United Kingdom (2011) ECHR 2087	238–9
Ottey v Grundy (2003) EWCA Civ 1176	149, 151
Overseas Tankship (UK) Ltd v Morts Dock and Engineering Co Ltd (The Wagon Mound No 1) [1961] UKPC 1, [1961] AC 388 (PC)	224–5
Parker v British Airways (1982) 1 QB 1004 (CA)	190, 202, 206
Parker v Parker (2003) EWHC 1846 (Ch)	143, 148
Pegasus Leasing Ltd v Confini (Unreported, 13 November 1991) (Austral.)	207
Penn Central Transp. Co. v New York City 438 US 104 (1978)	73, 103–4, 114–15, 117
Pennsylvania Coal Co. v Mahon 260 US 393 (1922)	72–3, 102–3, 107–8, 110
Perre v Apand Pty Ltd (1999) HCA 36	229, 231
Pierson v Post 3 Cai R 175 (NY 1805)	15, 34, 37–8, 43, 78, 183, 190
Plouf v Putnam 81 Vt 471 (1908); 83 Vt 494 (1910)	35, 48
Plymouth Coal Co. v Pennsylvania 232 US 531 (1914)	102–4, 107–12, 114
Powell v McFarlane (1979) 38 P & CR 452 (HC)	211
Pridean Ltd v Forest Taverns Ltd (1996) EWCA Civ 1060, 75 P & CR 447 (CA)	145–6
R v East Sussex County Council ex parte Reprotech (Pebsham) Ltd (2003) 1 WLR 348	128
R v Harding (1807) 1 Russ & Ry 125	209
R v Riley (1853) 169 ER 674	207, 210
R v Thurborn (1849) 175 ER 349	206–7
R v Watts (1953) 1 SCR 505	206
Ramsden v Dyson (1886) LR 1 HL 129	146
Rapier v London Tramways Co. (1893) 2 Ch 588	226
Re Ellenborough Park (1956) Ch 131	257
Re Montagu's Settlement Trusts (1987) Ch 264	241
Re St Clair Beach Estates Ltd and MacDonald (1974) 50 DLR 3d 650 (Ont HCJ)	80
Redland Bricks v Morris (1970) AC 652	231
Rhone v Stephens (1994) UKHL 3, 2 AC 310	197
Riggs v Palmer 22 NE 188 (NY 1889)	199–200
Rly v McNicholl (1918) 88 LJKB 601	217
Rooth v Wilson (1817) 1 B & Aid 59	206
Rylands v Fletcher (1868) 19 LT 220 (HL)	225
Sanborn v McLean 233 Mich 227, 206 NW 496 (1925)	123
Scribner v Beach 4 Denio 448, 47 Am Dec 265 (NY Sup Ct 1847)	212
Shelfer v City of London Electric Lighting Co. (1895) 1 Ch 287 (CA)	177
Shell UK Ltd v Total UK Ltd (2010) EWCA Civ 180	242
Sledmore v Dalby (1996) EWCA Civ 1305, 72 P & CR 196	149, 153
South Staffordshire Water Co. v Sharman (1896) 2 QB 44	206
Sovern v Yorlan 16 Or. 269, 20 P. 100 (1888)	206
Spartan Steel & Alloys Ltd v Martin & Co. Ltd (1973) 1 QB 27	228, 238
Star Energy Weald Basin Ltd and another v Bocardo SA (2010) UKSC 35	225
State v DeCoster 653 A2d 891 (Me 1995)	331
State v Schmid 423 A2d 615 (NJ 1980)	332
State v Shack 277 A2d 369 (NJ 1971)	331–2
Sturges v Bridgman (1879) 11 Ch D 852 (CA)	177–8
Taber v Jenny 23 F Cas 605 (D C Mass 1856)	37
Taddy & Co. v Sterious & Co. (1904) 1 Ch 354	241
Tapling v Jones (1865) 11 HLC 290	227, 231
Thompson-Schwab v Costaki (1956) 1 WLR 335	231–2
Thorner v Major (2009) 1 WLR 776 (HL)	128, 142–4, 146–7