



PHILOSOPHICAL FOUNDATIONS OF

European Union Law

EDITED BY
Julie Dickson
& Pavlos Eleftheriadis

OXFORD

PHILOSOPHICAL FOUNDATIONS OF EUROPEAN UNION LAW

This page intentionally left blank

PHILOSOPHICAL
FOUNDATIONS OF
EUROPEAN UNION
LAW

EDITED BY

JULIE DICKSON

AND

PAVLOS ELEFThERiADiS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© The several contributors 2012

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First Edition published in 2012

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted
by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence
Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI
and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

ISBN 978-0-19-958877-0

Printed and bound by
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

In memory of our dear friend, Amanda Perreau-Saussine

This page intentionally left blank

CONTENTS

Contributors ix

1 INTRODUCTION: THE PUZZLES OF EUROPEAN UNION LAW 1
Julie Dickson and Pavlos Eleftheriadis

PART I: THE LEGAL SYSTEM

2 TOWARDS A THEORY OF EUROPEAN UNION LEGAL SYSTEMS 25
Julie Dickson

**3 NOT A SYSTEM BUT AN ORDER: AN INTER-INSTITUTIONAL
VIEW OF EUROPEAN UNION LAW** 54
Keith Culver and Michael Giudice

4 HARMONIC LAW: THE CASE AGAINST PLURALISM 77
George Letsas

5 JUDICIAL DIALOGUE IN THE EUROPEAN UNION 109
Anthony Arnull

PART II: POLITICAL FOUNDATIONS

**6 DECIPHERING THE POLITICAL AND LEGAL DNA OF
EUROPEAN INTEGRATION: AN EXPLORATORY ESSAY** 137
J.H.H. Weiler

7 CITIZENSHIP AND OBLIGATION 159
Pavlos Eleftheriadis

**8 CONSTITUTIONALISM IN THE EUROPEAN UNION:
PIPE DREAM OR POSSIBILITY?** 189
W.J. Waluchow

**9 THE MORAL POINT OF CONSTITUTIONAL PLURALISM:
DEFINING THE DOMAIN OF LEGITIMATE INSTITUTIONAL
CIVIL DISOBEDIENCE AND CONSCIENTIOUS OBJECTION** 216
Mattias Kumm

10 THE IDEA OF EUROPEAN DEMOCRACY 247
Kalypso Nicolaidis

11 STATECRAFT AND THE FOUNDATIONS OF EUROPEAN UNION LAW	275
<i>Ari Afilalo and Dennis Patterson</i>	

PART III: CONSTITUTIONAL VIRTUES

12 PRECEDENT AND THE COURT OF JUSTICE: A JURISPRUDENCE OF DOUBT?	307
<i>Takis Tridimas</i>	
13 MONISM AND FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS	331
<i>Lorenzo Zucca</i>	
14 EUROPEAN INTEGRATION AND THE RULE OF LAW IN FOREIGN POLICY	354
<i>Geert De Baere</i>	
15 SOLIDARITY IN THE EUROPEAN UNION: PROBLEMS AND PROSPECTS	384
<i>Andrea Sangiovanni</i>	
16 THE PROBLEM OF JUSTICE IN THE EUROPEAN UNION: VALUES, PLURALISM, AND CRITICAL LEGAL JUSTICE	412
<i>Sionaidh Douglas-Scott</i>	
<i>Index</i>	449

CONTRIBUTORS

Ari Afilalo, Professor of Law, Rutgers-Camden School of Law.

Anthony Arnull, Barber Professor of Jurisprudence, University of Birmingham.

Keith Culver, Professor and Director, Okanagan Sustainability Institute, University of British Columbia.

Geert De Baere, Assistant Professor of International Law and EU Law at the Faculty of Law and Senior Member at the Leuven Centre for Global Governance Studies, University of Leuven.

Julie Dickson, Faculty of Law, University of Oxford, and Fellow and Tutor in Law, Somerville College, Oxford.

Sionaidh Douglas-Scott, Professor of European and Human Rights Law, University of Oxford.

Pavlos Eleftheriadis, Faculty of Law, University of Oxford, and Fellow and Tutor in Law, Mansfield College, Oxford.

Michael Giudice, Associate Professor of Philosophy, York University, Toronto, Canada.

Mattias Kumm, Professor for 'Rule of Law in the Age of Globalization', Social Science Research Center & Humboldt University, Berlin, and Inge Rennert Professor of Law, New York University School of Law.

George Letsas, Reader in Philosophy of Law and Human Rights, University College London.

Kalypso Nicolaidis, Professor of International Relations, University of Oxford.

Dennis Patterson, Chair in Legal Theory and Legal Philosophy at the European University Institute, Florence; Board of Governors Professor of Law and philosophy, Rutgers University, New Jersey, USA; Professor of International Trade and Jurisprudence, Swansea University.

Andrea Sangiovanni, Lecturer, Department of Philosophy, King's College London.

Takis Tridimas, Sir John Lubbock Professor of Banking Law, Queen Mary University of London; Professor and Nancy A Patterson Distinguished Faculty Scholar, Pennsylvania State University.

W.J. Waluchow, Professor of Philosophy and Senator William McMaster Chair in Constitutional Studies, McMaster University.

J.H.H. Weiler, NYU School of Law.

Lorenzo Zucca, Reader in Jurisprudence, King's College London.