

Nation, Class and Resentment

The Politics of National Identity
in England, Scotland and Wales



Robin Mann and
Steve Fenton



Palgrave Politics of Identity and Citizenship
Series

Series Editors

Varun Uberoi
Brunel University London
London, UK

Nasar Meer
University of Strathclyde
Glasgow, UK

Tariq Modood
University of Bristol
Bristol, UK

The politics of identity and citizenship has assumed increasing importance as our polities have become significantly more culturally, ethnically and religiously diverse. Different types of scholars, including philosophers, sociologists, political scientists and historians make contributions to this field and this series showcases a variety of innovative contributions to it. Focusing on a range of different countries, and utilizing the insights of different disciplines, the series helps to illuminate an increasingly controversial area of research and titles in it will be of interest to a number of audiences including scholars, students and other interested individuals.

More information about this series at
<http://www.springer.com/series/14670>

Robin Mann • Steve Fenton

Nation, Class and Resentment

The Politics of National Identity in England,
Scotland and Wales

palgrave
macmillan

Robin Mann
Bangor University
Bangor, UK

Steve Fenton
University of Bristol
Bristol, UK

Palgrave Politics of Identity and Citizenship Series
ISBN 978-1-137-46673-0 ISBN 978-1-137-46674-7 (eBook)
DOI 10.1057/978-1-137-46674-7

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016953850

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2017

The author(s) has/have asserted their right(s) to be identified as the author(s) of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Cover image © age fotostock / Alamy Stock Photo

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Macmillan Publishers Ltd.

The registered company address is: The Campus, 4 Crinan Street, London, N1 9XW, United Kingdom

Acknowledgements

The origins of this book lie with the research we undertook as part of the Leverhulme Programme on Migration and Citizenship, held by the University of Bristol and University College London, which ran between 2004 and 2009. This book draws extensively on the data collected for that project, and we express our gratitude to the Leverhulme Trust for funding it. Particular thanks go to Professor Tariq Modood and Professor John Salt, directors of the Leverhulme Programme. We also thank the many, many people who gave up their time to take part in the research.

We draw upon a number of other data sets in this book and fully appreciate the opportunities we were given to access them. A large amount of the survey material presented is based on an analysis of the 2015 British Election Study Internal Panel Survey. In addition, the data and analysis provided by YouGov, The Institute for Public Policy Research and the Future of England Surveys, British Social Attitudes Surveys, the What Scotland Thinks website, and Roger Scully's exceptional *Elections in Wales* blog all proved to be invaluable resources. Further qualitative interview material pertaining to Wales was based on research supported by the Wales Institute of Social and Economic Research, Data and Methods (WISERD), funded by the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC) (Grant RES-576-25-0021) and the Higher Education Funding

Council for Wales (HEFCW). We would like to thank colleagues across WISERD who are involved in the research for these projects.

In writing this book, we also have several individuals to thank. Special thanks must go to Graham Day for his careful reading of four draft chapters, as well as his insightful comments on the book as a whole; many thanks are extended to Ben Wellings, who exchanged some very useful emails and made some of his work available to us. We have benefited considerably from the key contributions of a large number of scholars working in the fields of national identity and the politics of nation. We owe an intellectual debt to Susan Condor, Robert Ford, Jon Fox, Steve Garner, Matthew Goodwin, Eric Kaufmann, Krishan Kumar, Michael Kenny, Tariq Modood and Richard Wyn Jones.

Thanks are also due to the following publishers for granting permission to use earlier versions of some of the material that appears in this book: Sage Publications for Mann, R. (2012) 'Uneasy being English? The significance of class for English national sentiments', *Ethnicities* 12(4): 484-499; and Palgrave Macmillan for Mann, R. and Fenton, S. (2015) 'English nationalism and Britishness: Class and the sub-state identities', in R. Garbaye and P. Schnapper (eds.) *The Politics of Ethnic Diversity in the British Isles*. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan. Pages 151-173.

Robin:

The completion of this book has coincided with my involvement in a major funding award made to WISERD from the ESRC to establish a Civil Society Research Centre (Award ES/L009099/1). I would like to express particular gratitude to Ian Rees Jones, director of WISERD, and Howard Davis, WISERD's co-director, for their support. Additional thanks go to my colleagues in the Bangor School of Social Sciences, who have made it such an agreeable place in which to research, teach, and write. They include Howard Davis, Martina Feilzer, Bethan Loftus, Cynog Prys, David Dallimore, and Marta Eichsteller.

From Robin: On a personal level, I wish to thank, first and foremost, my wife Bethan and my two sons, Edwin and Ioan, who have provided a constant, and welcome, distraction from the writing process. I also thank my parents, Valerie and William Mann and Ann and Peter Loftus, for their encouragement and support. Finally, these acknowledgements

would be incomplete if I did not also thank my co-author, Steve. After all, it was he who offered me my first academic post at the University of Bristol all those years ago to carry out this research. Over the past 10 years I have benefited immeasurably from his mentorship. This book is the culmination of our collaboration.

Steve is, as ever, so grateful to Jenny, Alex and Lynda for their love and support, and to Iona, Astrid and Isobel for so much fun and happiness.

Robin Mann and Steve Fenton
Bangor and Bristol
November 2016

Contents

1	Introduction: Nation and Class in Twenty-First-Century Britain	1
2	Resentment, Classes and National Sentiments	31
3	Class and Majority English Identities	71
4	The Politics of English Identity and Nationalism	99
5	The Nationalist Alternative: Nation and Class in Scotland	139
6	Wales, Nationalism and the Politics of Resentment	169
7	Conclusion	203
	Bibliography	211
	Index	241

List of Tables

Table 5.1	Differences by social class on the question ‘should Scotland be an independent country?’ (2013)	164
Table 5.2	Class support for SNP in 2010 and 2015 general elections	165
Table 5.3	Recall of 2010 vote of SNP voters in 2015 general election	166
Table 6.1	Moreno national identity in Wales, Scotland and England in 2012	193
Table 6.2	Intended vote in 2015 general election by chosen national identity in Wales (%)	197
Table 6.3	Party vote in general election 2015 by social class in Wales (%)	198
Table 6.4	Party vote in 2015 general election by country of birth in Scotland and Wales and by Welsh language ability in Wales (%)	198
Table 6.5	Preferences for Welsh Assembly powers by country of birth	199
Table 6.6	EU referendum and immigration by party, country of birth and Welsh language ability	200