



The Development of Monetary Economics

**A Modern Perspective on
Monetary Controversies**

D.P. O'Brien

The Development of Monetary Economics

To John Creedy with thanks

The Development of Monetary Economics

A Modern Perspective on Monetary
Controversies

D.P. O'Brien

*Emeritus Professor of Economics,
University of Durham, UK*



Edward Elgar

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

© D.P. O'Brien 2007

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by
Edward Elgar Publishing Limited
Glensanda House
Montpellier Parade
Cheltenham
Glos GL50 1UA
UK

Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc.
William Pratt House
9 Dewey Court
Northampton
Massachusetts 01060
USA

A catalogue record for this book
is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

O'Brien, D.P. (Denis Patrick), 1939–

The development of monetary economics : a modern perspective on
monetary controversies / by D.P. O'Brien.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

1. Monetary policy—History. I. Title.

HG230.3.O27 2007
332.4—dc22

2007000732

ISBN 978 1 84720 260 4

Printed and bound in Great Britain by MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall

Contents

| | |
|-------------------------|-------------|
| <i>List of Figures</i> | <i>ix</i> |
| <i>List of Tables</i> | <i>xi</i> |
| <i>Preface</i> | <i>xiii</i> |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | <i>xv</i> |

I Introduction

| | |
|-----------------------|----------|
| 1 Introduction | 1 |
|-----------------------|----------|

II Early Monetary Debates

| | |
|---|-----------|
| 2 Bodin's Analysis of Inflation | 9 |
| 2.1 European Inflation | 12 |
| 2.1.1 Inflation in France | 13 |
| 2.2 Scholastic Contribution | 15 |
| 2.2.1 Navarrus | 16 |
| 2.2.2 The Quantity Theory in the 16th Century | 17 |
| 2.3 The Paradoxes | 19 |
| 2.3.1 Bodin's Critique | 20 |
| 2.3.2 Bodin and the Causes of Inflation | 22 |
| 2.4 Exports and the Gains from Trade | 25 |
| 2.4.1 Gresham's Law | 27 |
| 2.4.2 The Demand for Money | 29 |
| 2.5 Inflation: Effects and Remedies | 30 |
| 2.5.1 Currency Reform | 31 |
| 2.6 Conclusions | 34 |
| 3 John Law: Money and Trade Considered | 37 |
| 3.1 Law's Concerns | 38 |
| 3.2 The Role of Money | 40 |
| 3.3 Silver Coinage | 41 |
| 3.4 The Monetary Growth Model | 42 |
| 3.5 Development and the Price Level | 45 |
| 3.6 Paper Money | 47 |

| | | |
|------------|---|------------|
| 3.7 | The Land Standard | 48 |
| 3.8 | A Formal Statement of Law's Model | 50 |
| 3.9 | Conclusions | 54 |
| 4 | The Rate of Interest: Locke and His Critics | 57 |
| 4.1 | Locke and the Usury Laws | 58 |
| 4.2 | Locke's Macroeconomic Vision | 61 |
| 4.3 | The Price Level | 65 |
| 4.4 | The Balance of Payments | 66 |
| 4.5 | Joseph Massie | 68 |
| 4.6 | David Hume | 73 |
| 4.7 | Conclusions | 76 |
| | | |
| III | 19th Century British Controversies | |
| 5 | The Currency and Banking Controversy | 79 |
| 5.1 | The Nature of Long-Run Equilibrium | 83 |
| 5.2 | The Need for Monetary Control | 93 |
| 5.3 | Macroeconomic Management of Disturbances | 96 |
| 5.4 | The Monetary Aggregate | 100 |
| 5.5 | Conclusions | 105 |
| 6 | Monetary Base Control | 107 |
| 6.1 | The Monetary Background | 108 |
| 6.2 | The Bank Charter Act of 1844 | 111 |
| | 6.2.1 The Debate | 111 |
| | 6.2.2 Provisions of the Act | 112 |
| 6.3 | Wider Considerations | 115 |
| | 6.3.1 Other Means of Payment | 115 |
| | 6.3.2 The Nature of the Monetary Base | 116 |
| | 6.3.3 Causes of Gold Loss | 116 |
| 6.4 | The Issues Tested | 117 |
| 6.5 | Era I: The Data 1833-44 | 118 |
| | 6.5.1 Control of the Note Issue | 118 |
| | 6.5.2 Changes in the Price Level | 120 |
| | 6.5.3 The Price Level | 126 |
| | 6.5.4 Bills of Exchange | 129 |
| 6.6 | Era II: 1844-57 | 132 |
| | 6.6.1 The Change in the Composition of the Country Bank Note Issue | 132 |
| | 6.6.2 Control of the Note Issue | 135 |
| | 6.6.3 Changes in the Price Level | 139 |
| | 6.6.4 The Price Level | 142 |
| | 6.6.5 Bills of Exchange | 144 |

| | | |
|-----------|--|------------|
| 6.6.6 | Macroeconomic Variability | 146 |
| 6.7 | Conclusions | 152 |
| 7 | The Lender of Last Resort Concept | 157 |
| 7.1 | The 1790s: Baring and Thornton | 159 |
| 7.2 | The Crisis of 1825 | 162 |
| 7.3 | Thomas Joplin and Vincent Stuckey | 163 |
| 7.4 | The 1832 Hearings | 165 |
| 7.5 | Joplin in the 1830s | 168 |
| 7.6 | The Bank Charter Debates | 170 |
| 7.7 | The 1844 Act and Last-Resort | 171 |
| 7.8 | The Second Crisis: 1857 | 174 |
| 7.9 | The Aftermath: the Overend and Gurney Crisis | 175 |
| 7.10 | Conclusions | 176 |
| | | |
| IV | Macroeconomic Models | |
| 8 | Bagehot and Stabilisation | 179 |
| 8.1 | Bagehot's Model | 182 |
| 8.1.1 | The Cycle | 183 |
| 8.1.2 | Income | 184 |
| 8.1.3 | Interest Rates | 187 |
| 8.1.4 | Savings, Investment and the Money Supply | 189 |
| 8.1.5 | The Price Level | 189 |
| 8.1.6 | The Balance of Payments | 191 |
| 8.1.7 | Bullion and the Banking Department Reserve | 193 |
| 8.1.8 | Bank Rate | 194 |
| 8.2 | The Question of Stability | 196 |
| 8.2.1 | Bagehot's Recommendations | 196 |
| 8.2.2 | A Formal Treatment of Stability | 198 |
| 8.3 | Conclusions | 199 |
| 9 | Joplin's Model: A Formal Statement | 201 |
| 9.1 | List of Variables | 205 |
| 9.2 | The Goods Market | 205 |
| 9.3 | The Money Market | 208 |
| 9.3.1 | Goods Market Transactions | 208 |
| 9.3.2 | Financial Market Transactions | 211 |
| 9.3.3 | The Balance of Payments | 212 |
| 9.3.4 | Aggregate Supply and the Labour Market | 213 |
| 9.3.5 | Aggregate Demand | 216 |
| 9.4 | Conclusions | 217 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 10 Stability With an Inbuilt Cycle | 219 |
| 10.1 The Currency School: Metallic Fluctuation | 220 |
| 10.2 The Banking School | 224 |
| 10.3 The Amplitude of Fluctuations | 226 |
| 10.4 Conclusions | 228 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 231 |
| <i>Index</i> | 253 |